



Designation: D7155 – 20

Standard Practice for Evaluating Compatibility of Mixtures of Turbine Lubricating Oils¹

This standard is issued under the fixed designation D7155; the number immediately following the designation indicates the year of original adoption or, in the case of revision, the year of last revision. A number in parentheses indicates the year of last reapproval. A superscript epsilon (ϵ) indicates an editorial change since the last revision or reapproval.

1. Scope*

1.1 This practice covers the compatibility of mixtures of turbine lubricating oils as defined by Specification **D4304**. The methods compare properties of specific mixtures with those of the neat oils after storage at specified conditions.

1.2 The methods are grouped into four tiers of testing types:

- 1.2.1 *Tier 1*—Visual appearance
- 1.2.2 *Tier 2*—Interfacial properties
- 1.2.3 *Tier 3*—Physical and chemical properties
- 1.2.4 *Tier 4*—Specific performance properties

1.3 The methods can be used to evaluate new (unused) lubricant compatibility or the effects of adding new (unused) lubricant to in-service lubricant in the system.

1.4 This practice does not evaluate the wear prevention characteristics, load carrying capacity, or the mechanical shear stability of lubricants mixtures while in service. If anti-wear (AW), extreme pressure (EP), or shear stability are to be evaluated, further testing of these parameters may be required.

1.5 Mixtures of the two constituent oils are evaluated using the Tier 1 and Tier 2 testing protocol. Sequential or concurrent testing is continued by applying tests from Tier 3 or Tier 4 until the test requestor or user is satisfied that the intent of this practice has been met. If any mixture fails the methods, the oils are considered incompatible by that method. If all mixtures pass the methods, the oils are considered compatible by those methods. It is recommended that passing only Tier 1 does not adequately test for fluid compatibility.

1.6 If the mixture passes Tier 1, it shows two oils are visually compatible only. If the mixture passes Tier 1 and 2, it shows two oils are visually and interfacially compatible. If the mixture passes Tier 1, 2 and 3, it shows two oils are visually, interfacially, physically, and chemically compatible. If the mixture passes Tier 1, 2, 3, 4, it shows two oils are compatible

with the highest confidence level. Testing each tier level is giving the user more confidence that the two fluids are compatible.

1.7 This practice applies only to lubricating oils having characteristics suitable for evaluation by the suggested test methods. If the scope of a specific test method limits testing to those oils within a specified range of properties, oils outside that range cannot be tested for compatibility by that test method.

1.8 This practice may be used to evaluate the compatibility of different types and grades of oil. However, it is not intended to evaluate such mixtures for lubrication performance. The user is advised to consult with suppliers in these situations.

1.9 This practice does not purport to cover all test methods that could be employed.

1.10 The values stated in SI units are to be regarded as standard. The values given in parentheses after SI units are provided for information only and are not considered standard.

1.11 *This standard does not purport to address all of the safety concerns, if any, associated with its use. It is the responsibility of the user of this standard to establish appropriate safety, health, and environmental practices and determine the applicability of regulatory limitations prior to use.*

1.12 *This international standard was developed in accordance with internationally recognized principles on standardization established in the Decision on Principles for the Development of International Standards, Guides and Recommendations issued by the World Trade Organization Technical Barriers to Trade (TBT) Committee.*

2. Referenced Documents

2.1 *ASTM Standards:*²

D130 Test Method for Corrosiveness to Copper from Petroleum Products by Copper Strip Test

D445 Test Method for Kinematic Viscosity of Transparent and Opaque Liquids (and Calculation of Dynamic Viscosity)

¹ This practice is under the jurisdiction of ASTM Committee **D02** on Petroleum Products, Liquid Fuels, and Lubricants and is the direct responsibility of Subcommittee **D02.C0.01** on Turbine Oil Monitoring, Problems and Systems.

Current edition approved May 1, 2020. Published June 2020. Originally approved in 2006. Last previous edition approved in 2018 as D7155 – 18. DOI: 10.1520/D7155-20.

² For referenced ASTM standards, visit the ASTM website, www.astm.org, or contact ASTM Customer Service at service@astm.org. For *Annual Book of ASTM Standards* volume information, refer to the standard's Document Summary page on the ASTM website.

*A Summary of Changes section appears at the end of this standard

D611 Test Methods for Aniline Point and Mixed Aniline Point of Petroleum Products and Hydrocarbon Solvents

D664 Test Method for Acid Number of Petroleum Products by Potentiometric Titration

D665 Test Method for Rust-Preventing Characteristics of Inhibited Mineral Oil in the Presence of Water

D892 Test Method for Foaming Characteristics of Lubricating Oils

D893 Test Method for Insolubles in Used Lubricating Oils

D974 Test Method for Acid and Base Number by Color-Indicator Titration

D1401 Test Method for Water Separability of Petroleum Oils and Synthetic Fluids

D1500 Test Method for ASTM Color of Petroleum Products (ASTM Color Scale)

D2270 Practice for Calculating Viscosity Index from Kinematic Viscosity at 40 °C and 100 °C

D2272 Test Method for Oxidation Stability of Steam Turbine Oils by Rotating Pressure Vessel

D3120 Test Method for Trace Quantities of Sulfur in Light Liquid Petroleum Hydrocarbons by Oxidative Microcoulometry

D3427 Test Method for Air Release Properties of Hydrocarbon Based Oils

D4175 Terminology Relating to Petroleum Products, Liquid Fuels, and Lubricants

D4304 Specification for Mineral and Synthetic Lubricating Oil Used in Steam or Gas Turbines

D4310 Test Method for Determination of Sludging and Corrosion Tendencies of Inhibited Mineral Oils

D4629 Test Method for Trace Nitrogen in Liquid Hydrocarbons by Syringe/Inlet Oxidative Combustion and Chemiluminescence Detection

D5185 Test Method for Multielement Determination of Used and Unused Lubricating Oils and Base Oils by Inductively Coupled Plasma Atomic Emission Spectrometry (ICP-AES)

D5762 Test Method for Nitrogen in Liquid Hydrocarbons, Petroleum and Petroleum Products by Boat-Inlet Chemiluminescence

D5846 Test Method for Universal Oxidation Test for Hydraulic and Turbine Oils Using the Universal Oxidation Test Apparatus

D6186 Test Method for Oxidation Induction Time of Lubricating Oils by Pressure Differential Scanning Calorimetry (PDSC)

D6304 Test Method for Determination of Water in Petroleum Products, Lubricating Oils, and Additives by Coulometric Karl Fischer Titration

D6514 Test Method for High Temperature Universal Oxidation Test for Turbine Oils

D7042 Test Method for Dynamic Viscosity and Density of Liquids by Stabinger Viscometer (and the Calculation of Kinematic Viscosity)

D7843 Test Method for Measurement of Lubricant Generated Insoluble Color Bodies in In-Service Turbine Oils using Membrane Patch Colorimetry

D7873 Test Method for Determination of Oxidation Stability and Insolubles Formation of Inhibited Turbine Oils at 120 °C Without the Inclusion of Water (Dry TOST Method)

D8148 Test Method for Spectroscopic Determination of Haze in Fuels

3. Terminology

3.1 For definitions of terms used in this test method, refer to Terminology **D4175**.

3.2 Definitions of Terms Specific to This Standard:

3.2.1 *compatibility*, *n*—of lubricating oils, the ability of lubricating oils to mix together without significant degradation of properties or performance.

3.2.1.1 *Discussion*—When a mixture of two oils has properties or performance significantly inferior to either of the constituent oils, then the two oils are incompatible. If the properties are inferior to those of one neat oil but not inferior to those of the other, then such is not necessarily considered an indication of incompatibility. To be considered significantly inferior, the property of the mixture would be worse than the poorer of the two neat oils by an amount exceeding the repeatability (or in the case of third party verification testing, the reproducibility) of the test method used to evaluate the property. (See the definitions for fail and pass.)

3.2.2 *fail*, *n*—in compatibility testing of oil mixtures, a test result that is inferior to that of the poorer of the two constituent oils by an amount exceeding the repeatability of the test method used for the evaluation.

3.2.3 *insolubles*, *n*—solids or semi-solid material that accumulate on the bottom of a liquid. As broadened, insolubles include varnishes and “non-sedimentation materials” resulting from fluid incompatibility that change the appearance of a bright and clear liquid to “hazy” or “cloudy.”

3.2.4 *pass*, *n*—in compatibility testing of oil mixtures, a test result that is equal to or better than that of the poorer of the two constituent oils by an amount exceeding the repeatability of the test method used for the evaluation.

3.2.5 *type and grade*, *n*—type and grade refer to lubricants of the same general type such as Rust and Oxidation Inhibited turbine oil (R&O) and ISO Viscosity grades.

3.2.6 *10:90 mixture*, *n*—a uniform blend of 10 % by volume of one oil with 90 % by volume of a second oil.

3.2.7 *50:50 mixture*, *n*—a uniform blend of 50 % by volume of each of two component oils.

3.2.8 *90:10 mixture*, *n*—a uniform blend of 90 % by volume of one oil with 10 % by volume of a second oil.

4. Summary of Practice

4.1 *Option 1*—Prepare a 50:50 mixture of two oils to be evaluated for compatibility. This mixture and the two neat, constituent oils are tested using the compatibility tests. Depending on the performance of the mixture, relative to those of the constituent oils, 10:90 and 90:10 mixtures may need to be tested in addition.

4.2 *Option 2*—Instead of testing mixtures in sequential order, 10:90 and 90:10 mixtures are tested at the same time the 50:50 mixture is evaluated. If all mixtures pass Tier 1 and 2 compatibility tests, or if the application requires the evaluation of specific properties, Tier 3 and 4 compatibility tests can be employed for further evaluation. Such tests can be run concurrently, if desired.

5. Significance and Use

5.1 The compatibility of oils can be important for users of oil-lubricated equipment. Mixing of two oils can produce a substance markedly inferior to either of its constituent materials. One or more of the following can occur:

5.1.1 A mixture of incompatible oils most often forms a precipitate. The precipitate will form unwanted deposits in the lubrication system, plug filters, and oil passageways.

5.1.2 A mixture of incompatible oils will sometimes exhibit degradation of certain performance parameters like demulsibility, foam inhibition oxidation stability, rust protection ability, or antiwear protection ability.

5.1.3 A mixture of incompatible oils will sometimes exhibit non-miscibility of the base oils with each other.

5.1.4 Such incompatibilities can lead to catastrophic equipment failures.

5.2 To minimize the chances of these problems occurring, lubricant suppliers recommend evaluating compatibility of lubricating oil of different formulations and sources prior to mixing. Equipment users most often do not have the resources to evaluate oil compatibility and must rely on their suppliers. Mixing of oils without first determining the compatibility is a highly imprudent practice.

5.3 Although new turbine oils may be compatible, in-service oil of the same type may be degraded or contaminated to such an extent that the new oil added may not be compatible with the system oil. In-service oil compatibility with new oil additions should be evaluated on a case-by-case basis.

5.4 The oxidation resistance of different oils of the same type can vary widely, and compatibility does not imply equivalent performance without oxidation performance testing.

6. Apparatus

6.1 The equipment and materials required for this practice shall be those required by the test methods used to evaluate compatibility.

6.1.1 *Laboratory Oven*, static-air or stirred-air type, capable of maintaining the test temperature within $\pm 3^\circ\text{C}$ and equipped with one or more grill-type wire shelves.

6.1.2 *Laboratory Cooler*, capable of maintaining the test temperature within $\pm 3^\circ\text{C}$.

6.1.3 *Reflector Flood Lamp*, 150 W.

7. Procedure

7.1 Testing is conducted (see Section 7.3 – 7.6) for mixture proportions as agreed upon with the test requestor or user and dependent on the available sample volumes supplied. Either the sequential testing protocol described in Option 1 or the concurrent testing protocol described in Option 2 can be used.

Using Option 1, a 50:50 mixture and the two constituent oils are tested. If this mixture is found compatible, 10:90 and 90:10 mixtures which reflect drain-and fill conversion or make up proportions may be tested. Using Option 2, all mixtures (10:90, 50:50, and 90:10) and the two constituent oils are tested concurrently. At the discretion of the interested parties, the testing may be continued even after an incompatible test result is observed.

7.2 *Preparation of Mixtures*—Prepare mixtures similarly, regardless of whether one or three mixtures of differing ratios will be tested sequentially or concurrently.

7.2.1 Blend a fresh mixture of the two oils to be evaluated for compatibility (neat, constituent oils are designated A and B). Determine the amounts to be mixed from the amount of oil required by the tests. Blend at least 10 % more mixture than is actually needed for the tests. Do not blend more than can be used immediately. No more than 7 days should elapse between mixture preparation and the start of any test.

7.2.1.1 For example, one can prepare a 50:50 mixture by adding equal amounts $\pm 1\%$ of oils, neat oils A and B, into a separate clean, dry, glass beaker, and mixing thoroughly.

7.2.2 Heat the beaker and mixtures in the oven, or appropriate heating assembly, at $65^\circ\text{C} \pm 3^\circ\text{C}$ for a minimum of 23 h to 25 h with occasional mixing before completing the mixing procedure.

NOTE 1—Test Method D7843 has taught us the sample shall be heated for 23 h to 25 h for proper incorporation of the insoluble components.

7.2.3 After the blending procedure is complete, the user may continue heating the sample in an oven for the incubation time or instead, not heat and store at room temperature for the incubation time.

NOTE 2—The storage temperature needs to be agreed between the parties involved.

7.2.4 However, before testing, a room temperature incubation is suggested as described in Test Method D7843, subsection 8.2, stored between 15°C to 25°C , away from UV light for an incubation period of 68 h to 76 h.

NOTE 3—Test Method D7843 testing has taught that the proper formation of varnish particles requires this incubation period condition. Many examples have reported no insoluble material formed directly after the heating cycle.

7.3 *Tier 1 Testing*—This is the first series of evaluation for the oils. The properly blended oils (Section 7.2) may be tested using the recommended Tier 1 tests.

7.3.1 Observe the oil in accordance with Appendix X1. If the oils display an incompatible result, conclude the test and report in accordance with Section 8.

7.4 *Tier 2 Testing*—This is the second series of evaluation for the oils. The properly blended oils (Section 7.2) may be tested using the recommended Tier 2 tests.

7.4.1 Compatibility issues of oils can have their root cause through the variation of interfacial forces of the fluid: liquid-liquid (Test Method D1401), liquid-gas (Test Method D892) and liquid-solid (Test Method D7843). For that reason, interfacial tests are recommended to be included as a part of

required testing. When oils are blended the lack of compatibility is accentuated at the fluid surfaces. Measuring these interfacial properties provides a closer look at the fluid interactions and demonstrate the oil compatibility or lack of compatibility. Many times, the changes in these interface properties are the cause of changes in other properties.

NOTE 4—Use great care when preparing the contents of the beaker for some tests. Semi-solid material not visible to the unaided eye may have settled to the bottom of the vessel. This material needs to be thoroughly mixed back into the sample prior to testing for insolubles.

7.4.2 Membrane Patch Colorimetry Test (MPC)—Determine and record the membrane patch test results as described in Test Method **D7843**. Varnish production or insoluble formation is a measurement of oil compatibility. The Tier 1 visual testing is a crude visual measurement of this property. In many cases the amount of the insoluble is too small to be observed visually. For this reason, it is recommended to test the oil by Test Method **D7843** (MPC testing). The formation of solids (insoluble or varnish) is a physical measure of the liquid to solid interface. Oil incompatibility shows changes in the liquid-solid interface more frequently than many other properties. A blend of the oils that shows an increase in the MPC values is considered failing this test. Record as *compatible* or *pass* if the insoluble content of the mixture is the same or lower than both of the constituent oils by an amount greater than repeatability of the test method. Record as *incompatible* or *fail* if the insoluble content of the mixture is greater than the larger of the two constituent oils by an amount greater than repeatability of the test.

7.4.2.1 Pentane Insolubles—Determine the pentane insoluble content using Test Method **D893**. Similar to the **D7843**, the pentane insoluble test is a measure of the liquid-solid interface and could be considered a basic Tier 2 test as well. The mixture is considered to be compatible if the pentane insoluble content of the mixture is equal to or less than either constituent oil. Record as *compatible* or *pass* if the insoluble content of the mixture is the same or lower than both of the constituent oils by an amount greater than repeatability of the test method. Record as *incompatible* or *fail* if the insoluble content of the mixture is greater than the larger of the two constituent oils by an amount greater than repeatability of the test.

7.4.2.2 Test Method **D7843** is more sensitive to low levels of varnish formation than Test Method **D893**. There needs to be an agreement between the parties involved as to the measurement test method of the insoluble content.

7.4.3 Foaming Characteristics—Determine and record the foaming characteristic as described in Test Method **D892**. Sequence I foam testing is the recommended procedure. Foam is an example of the measurement of the liquid-air interface property. Like insoluble material formation and the liquid-solid property, the air-liquid property is one of those properties very sensitive to oil incompatibility. Degradation of this property is one of the first observed between incompatible oils. The mixture is considered to be compatible if the foaming characteristic of the mixture is equal to or less than either constituent oil. Record as *compatible* or *pass* if the foaming characteristic of the mixture is better (less) than the constituent oils by an

amount greater than repeatability of the test method. Record as *incompatible* or *fail* if the foaming characteristic is worse (more) than the constituent oils by an amount greater than repeatability of the test.

7.4.3.1 Air Release Properties—Determine and record the air release property as described in Test Methods **D3427**.

7.4.3.2 Air release is another example of the measurement of the liquid-air interface property. Due to its measurement complexity, it is not typically considered a Tier 2 test but it could augment foam as an air-liquid test if desired. The mixture is considered to be compatible if the air release properties of the mixture are equal to or better (lower air release time) than either constituent oil. Record as *compatible* or *pass* if the air release property of the mixture is equal to or better than the constituent oils by an amount greater than repeatability of the test method. Record as *incompatible* or *fail* if the air release property of the mixture is worse (higher air release time) than the constituent oils by an amount greater than repeatability of the test.

7.4.3.3 There needs to be an agreement between the parties involved as to the measurement test method of the air-liquid property test.

7.4.4 Water Separability—Determine and record the water separability results as described in Test Method **D1401**. Water separation (demulsibility) is a measurement of the liquid-liquid interface property. The liquid-liquid interface property is the third interface property that shows a high degree of sensitivity to oils compatibility. The mixture is considered to be compatible if the water separability of the mixture is equal to or better (lower demulsibility time) than either constituent oil. Record as *compatible* or *pass* if the water separability of the mixture is better than the constituent oils by an amount greater than repeatability of the test method. Record as *incompatible* or *fail* if the water separability of the mixture is worse (higher demulsibility time) than the constituent oils by an amount greater than the repeatability of the test method.

NOTE 5—If one of the oils is an in-service oil the test results on the initial oils being blended may not be passing for a new oil specification; however, the compatibility of the blend is judged based on a degradation the initial oil test values.

NOTE 6—Some oils do not demulsify. In these cases, this test may not be relevant.

7.4.5 Obtain results for Test Methods **D1401**, **D892** and **D7843** in accordance with these test procedures. If the results show a derating for the blended oil compared to the initial oils, these oils can be considered as incompatible; conclude the test and report in accordance with Section 8. If the results are satisfactory and Tier 3 or Tier 4 level testing is to be conducted, proceed to **7.5** or **7.6**. If only Tier 1 and Tier 2 testing were requested the testing can be concluded and reported in accordance with Section 8.

7.5 Tier 3 Testing—If resources permit, the specified tests can be performed concurrently. Otherwise, any sequence of these tests can be used. The properly blended oils (**7.2**) may be tested using the recommended Tier 3 tests.

7.5.1 Tier 3 testing is focused on compatibility with respect to physical and chemical properties.